

## **Minutes**

### **of The 4<sup>th</sup> Seminar on Environmental Auditing and The 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Meeting of ASOSAI WGEA**

18 - 20 September 2012, Penang, Malaysia

The 4<sup>th</sup> Seminar on Environmental Auditing and 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Meeting of ASOSAI Working Group on Environment Audit (WGEA) was held in Penang, Malaysia from 18 to 20 September, 2012. The meeting was presided over by Dr. Dong Dasheng, Deputy Auditor General of China National Audit Office on behalf of the Chairman of the Working Group. The list of delegates who attended the meeting as members and observers are attached as Annexure.

#### **1. Agenda item 1: Welcome Address**

H.E. Tan Sri Ambrin Buang, Auditor General of Malaysia welcomed Dr. Dong Dasheng, the Chair Deputy Auditor General of China, and all other delegates to Malaysia. He felt really grateful to be given the honour to host the seminar and meeting in Penang. The presence of representatives from the public sector audit institutions showed their commitment to tackle environmental governance and accountability issues to achieve the goals and strategies of sustainable development as laid out at the Rio+20 United Nation Summit on sustainable development. His speech also touched on the role of Malaysian Government in ensuring balance economic development with environmental protection. He also recognizes the efforts of INTOSAI and ASOSAI WGEA in promoting the importance and role of the SAIs in the International and Asian environmental governance and sustainable development. He wished the meeting all success in its deliberations and the members an enjoyable stay in Penang.

#### **2. Agenda item 2: INTOSAI Remarks**

Ms. Kaire Kesküla conveyed the warmest greeting and wishes the best of luck for the meeting from the Chairman of INTOSAI WGEA and thanked the SAI Malaysia for the warm welcome and believed that Malaysia is a very good venue for the meeting especially for the full force of Mother Nature are well preserved in the country. She shared the progress report and overview of activities of INTOSAI WGEA with all participants, including the key WG documents completed in 2010, 2011-2013 WP projects, INTOSAI Journal-special EA issue, recent WGEA meetings, upcoming 15th WG

meeting, Rio+20 and World Congress on Justice, Governance and law and so on. She felt that ASOSAI had evolved to a prominent region in terms promoting the environmental auditing practice and wished to take part in a productive meeting with knowledge exchange and constructive discussion.

### **3. Agenda item 3: Opening Remarks**

Dr. Dong Dasheng, Deputy Auditor General of China on behalf of Mr. Liu Jiayi, Auditor General of China who is also Chairman of ASOSAI WGEA said Environment is the foundation upholding human survival and development and it is the due obligation of each country and each nation to care for the earth, maintain the ecological system and protect the environment. He hoped all participants will be able to obtain useful information through discussions, and learn new ideas and techniques of environmental auditing. He also said that the meeting will be a very impressive one with the efforts and inputs made by the SAI of Malaysia and expressed his heartfelt gratitude to the SAI of Malaysia for the hosting the event.

### **4. Agenda item 4: Chair's Progress Report**

The work report of ASOSAI was presented by Dr. Dong Dasheng from SAI China. Dr. Dong began his presentation by highlighting the development of environmental auditing in Asia since 2009. Among the developments is most SAIs have the mandate to conduct an environmental audit. This leads to the increase of the number of environmental audits conducted by the SAIs. The SAIs of Asian countries have maintained good cooperation and collaboration in the environmental audit area. The scope of auditing covers the main area of environmental issues in respective countries. Dr. Dong also highlighted that the Asian SAIs are actively participating in the activities of INTOSAI WGEA. However, Dr. Dong stated that the SAIs still face challenges in the field of environmental audit. He called upon all SAIs intensify cooperation and generate new progress and achievements in areas including cooperative audits, information sharing and communication.

Dr. Dong then talked about the work of the ASOSAI WGEA secretariat in the recent years. The secretariat had issued the 2011-2013 Work Plan of ASOSAI WGEA to the members. In February 2011, the secretariat of ASOSAI WGEA had conducted the 3<sup>rd</sup> survey on environmental audit in aiming to gain understanding about the awareness and practices of cooperative environmental audit and collecting ideas about future cooperative audit

plans. By May 2011, the secretariat received the response of 27 SAIs. Apart from that, the secretariat also updates its website to show the latest developments of the ASOSAI WGEA and welcome the member SAIs to contribute articles, materials, cases and techniques in conducting environmental audit. Dr. Dong concluded his presentation by asking the members to further push the development of environmental audit in the Asian region.

#### **5. Agenda item 5: Presentation–The Use of Remote Sensing and Geographical Information System (GIS) in the Environmental Audit**

The Director General of Malaysia Remote Sensing Agency (ARSM) briefly explained how remote sensing and Geographical Information System (GIS) is closely related in which the information collected by remote sensing and various data sources will be combined and used by the systems to produce output that will be used by decision makers. The implementation mechanism for remote sensing and GIS applications in environmental auditing will involve the satellite image acquisition which will then be received by the ground station. After that, the information will be extracted and updated in the database which is accessible and analysable by various applications including auditing application. He concluded that remote sensing data has capability to generate valuable information that is needed for more effective resources, environmental and disaster management and also in environmental auditing.

#### **6. Agenda item 6: Presentation – The Impact of Climate Change on the Nation’s Well Being**

The Deputy Secretary of the Environmental Management and Climate Change Division, Ministry of Natural Resources And Environment, began his presentation on The Impact of Climate Change on the Nation’s Well Being by explaining about the greenhouse gasses (GHG’s) and the global sources of GHG’s such as energy, industry, agriculture and others. He stated the needs of environment auditing on loss and damage due to extreme weather events attributable to climate change; emissions reductions commitments by developed countries; nationally appropriate mitigation actions by developing countries, enabled by finance, technology transfer and capacity building by developed countries; and support and means of implementation provided by developed countries. He concluded that significant need for environmental auditing is envisioned since the natural resources that are vulnerable to climate change need to be protected and conserved.

## **7. Agenda item 7: Country Paper Presentations (Audit on Water):**

There were six country paper presentations on the Experience in Water Auditing from SAIs of India, Iran, Iraq, Malaysia, China and Thailand with the following topics:

- (a) Water Pollution in India – SAI India
- (b) Environmental Audit of Caspian Sea – SAI Iran
- (c) Pollution of the Tigris River – SAI Iraq
- (d) Water Quality Management In Malaysia – SAI Malaysia
- (e) Auditing on the Yellow River Basin – SAI China
- (f) Cooperation Environmental Audit on The Mekong River Basin Management – SAI Thailand

All papers focused on the issue of "water pollution". The SAIs carried out compliance and performance audit of the governments at various levels on their policies, plans, standards, supervision and management in coping with water pollution, preventing river and marine pollution and protecting the safety of drinking water.

## **8. Agenda item 8: Country Paper Presentations (Audit on Climate Change)**

There were six country paper presentations on Climate Change Audit from SAIs of Australia, Japan, China, Russia, Indonesia, Saudi Arabia, Thailand and Malaysia with the following topics:

- (a) Auditing Climate Change Programs – SAI Australia
- (b) Auditing on Climate Change – SAI Japan
- (c) Audit Investigation on Energy Conservation and Pollution Reduction – SAI China
- (d) Audit on Adaptation to Climate Change – SAI Russian Federation
- (e) Audit of Forest Management Activities Related to the Forest Inventory, Setting Forest Area, Mitigation Climate Change, Forest Use Permit and Use Of Forest Areas, Forest Logging and it's Reporting, and Forest Protection Zone – SAI Indonesia
- (f) Environmental Auditing Efforts – SAI Saudi Arabia

All papers focused on the issue of the reduction of pollutants emission. The SAIs have conducted compliance and performance audit of the governments at all levels on the measures to cope with climate change and reduce the greenhouse gas emission, including governments' fiscal and tax

policies that aims at reducing the anthropogenic emissions of greenhouse gases, and measures to improve energy efficiency and strengthen the monitoring and management.

## **9. Agenda item 9: Country Paper Presentations (International Cooperation on Environmental Auditing)**

There were six country paper presentations on Climate Change Audit from SAIs of Australia, Japan, China, Russia, Indonesia, Saudi Arabia, Thailand and Malaysia with the following topics:

- (a) Promote the Further Development of Cooperative Environmental Auditing in Asia Together – SAI China
- (b) Transregional Capacity Building Programme for Performance Audit of Environmental Issues in Forestry 2010 – 2012 – SAI Thailand
- (c) Illegal, Unreported & Unregulated Fishing and it's Environment – SAI Indonesia and SAI Malaysia

All participants have reached the following consensus on the cooperative environmental audit:

- (a) The cooperative environmental audit should play an active role in coping with trans-boundary environmental issues of common concern;
- (b) The parallel audit is an appropriate form to implement cooperative environmental audit in Asia;
- (c) The SAIs should actively respond to the call on cooperative audit put forward in the Johannesburg Accords by conducting cooperative environmental audit in a broader sense.

## **10. Agenda item 10: The 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Meeting of ASOSAI WGEA – Approval of the Rules of Procedures of ASOSAI WGEA**

Mr. Xing Jianfeng, Deputy Director of National Audit Office of China--Chair of ASOSAI WGEA, gave a briefing on the progress of the Rules of Procedures of ASOSAI WGEA. He highlighted that 12 SAIs gave comments and feedbacks on the draft of Rules of Procedures and stated the reasons of adoption or non-adoption. He also thanked all member SAIs of ASOSAI for their active participation in and strong support to the work of the WGEA and its Secretariat. At last all the participants approved the Rules of Procedures of ASOSAI WGEA.

**11. Agenda item 11: Discussion on Venue for the 5<sup>th</sup> Seminar and 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting of WGEA**

SAI-Vietnam agreed to host the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of Working Group in year 2014. The venue and the date for the meeting will be decided later. The chair thanked SAI-Vietnam, on behalf of all members for their gracious offer.

**12. Agenda item 12: Any other item for discussion with permission of the Chair**

There was no other issue for discussion at the meeting.

**13. Agenda item 13: Closing Remarks and Summing up**

At the end, On behalf of Mr Liu Jiayi, Chairman of the ASOSAI WGEA and Auditor General of China, Dr. Dong Dasheng congratulated all the participants on the complete success of the meeting. He said that many excellent presentations introducing to us good practices and major achievements in the field of environmental auditing and benefited from the meeting by gaining much new knowledge and experience. He thanked Mr. Tan Sri Ambrin Buang, Auditor General of Malaysia and his officers for organizing and hosting this meeting, and expressed his gratitude to all members of the Group for their active participation and support. Dr. Dong Dasheng then declared this meeting closed.

## Annexure

### Member Participants

No.	Countries	Name	Designation
1	Australia	Mr. Mark Thomas Simpson	Exec. Director
2	Bahrain	Mr. Qasim Ahmed Almadhoob	Director
3	Cambodia	Mr. Keo Thuch	Deputy Director
4	China	Dr. Dong Dasheng	Deputy Auditor General
5	China	Mr. Huang Bigui	Director General
6	China	Ms. Wang Dannong	Director General
7	China	Mr. Jiang Haiying	Deputy Director Gen.
8	China	Ms. Chen Jixiang	Director
9	China	Mr. Xing Jianfeng	Deputy Director
10	China	Mr. Liu Huibo	Deputy Director
11	China	Mr. Zhai Chuanqiang	Auditor
12	China	Ms. Fan Anyu	Auditor
13	China	Ms. Qu Jing	Auditor
14	China	Mr. Ruan Donghua	Auditor
15	Estonia	Ms. Kaire Kesküla	Sr. Adviser/Sec. INTOSAI
16	India	Ms. Nameeta Prasad	Director
17	Indonesia	Mr. Kamaluddin	Director of Audit
18	Indonesia	Ms. Ruspita Dewi	Senior Auditor
19	Indonesia	Ms. Dian Pusparini	Senior Auditor
20	Iran	Mr. Seyed Abbas Mirnajafi	Principal Auditor
21	Iran	Mr. Mansour Tour	Senior Auditor
22	Iraq	Mr. Rafil Yassein Khudhair Al-Assady	Director General
23	Iraq	Ms. Saosan Salman Ahmad Al Bassam	Senior Chief Audit Team
24	Iraq	Mr. Amer A. Antek Al-Yasiri	Chief of Agric. Eng
25	Iraq	Mr. Ali Hashem Saleh Al-Tikrety	Interpreter
26	Japan	Mr. Yujiro Ichikawa	Deputy Director
27	Korea	Mr. Young Seok Kim	Deputy Director
28	Korea	Mr. Young Il Shin	Assist. Director
29	Kuwait	Mr. Abdulaziz Naser Al- Rasheedi	Auditor
30	Kuwait	Mr. Khaled Ameen Al-Awadhi	Chief Auditor
31	Malaysia	Dato' Mustafa Bin Saman	Deputy AG

<b>No.</b>	<b>Countries</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Designation</b>
32	Malaysia	Mr. Abdul Rashid Bin Yaakub	Director
33	Malaysia	Mr.Ir. Md.Wahid Bin Mohd. Nor	Director
34	Malaysia	Ms. Fadzilah Binti Hj. Mohammad	Deputy Director
35	Malaysia	Ms. Shahani Binti Zainal Abidin	Asst. Audit Director
36	Malaysia	Ms. Eva Ratna Seri Ayu Binti Hamidi	Asst. Audit Director
37	Malaysia	Mr. Mohamad Hassan bin Salim	Asst. Audit Director
38	Myanmar	Ms. Naing Thet Oo	Deputy Dir. Gen.
39	Myanmar	Ms. Shwe Sin Latt	Audit Officer
40	Oman	Mr. Ahmed Abdullah Alkhalili	Auditor
41	Oman	Mr. Yaqoob Mohamed Alhosni	Auditor
42	Russia	Mr. Denis Sidorenko	Leading Inspector
43	Saudi Arabia	Mr. Sultan Marzouq Al-Otaibi	Auditor
44	Thailand	Mr.Prasopsuk Sungboonmark	Auditor
45	Thailand	Ms.Matulee Yokee	Senior Auditor
46	Turkey	Mr. Ali Serdar	Chairman TCA
47	Turkey	Mr. Sadettin Ceyhan	Auditor
48	Turkey	Ms. Berna Erkan	Auditor
49	Vietnam	Ms. Trinh Thi Nguyet Nhung	Prep. Auditor
50	Vietnam	Ms. Vu Thi Thanh Hai	Auditor
51	Yemen	Mr. Fouad Mabkhoot AL-Jaradi	Principal Auditor