



Message from the Chair of WGEA

Dear Colleagues,

The 13th INTOSAI WGEA Steering Committee meeting was held 2-5 April 2014 in Lombok, Indonesia. It was the first Steering Committee meeting of the 2014-2016 work period, and observing the enthusiasm and dedication of the members assured me of the strong support for achieving the 2014-2016 work plan. I want to thank all the Steering Committee members for making the meeting a success and bringing productive, value-added input to the work of INTOSAI WGEA.

The meeting set the cornerstone for the INTOSAI WGEA work plan. At the meeting, Steering Committee members approved project plans for 7 research papers, 1 guidance update, and 4 ISSAIs reviews. Members discussed and approved all the project outlines and the key milestones for these projects. They also discussed issues such as increasing cooperation between Regional WGEAs (RWGEAs) and INTOSAI WGEA and some additional WGEA and secretariat matters. INTOSAI WGEA will continue to work closely with RWGEAs on the exchange of subject matter experts, translation of INTOSAI WGEA's outputs, distribution of surveys, and audit collections. I hope that all Steering Committee members will work closely with one another, especially on projects, such as the ISSAI reviews, that need coordination from within and outside of the working group. I encourage members to focus more attention on this.

On this occasion, I would also like to welcome our three new members. The SAIs of the Bahamas, Nigeria, and Iraq have recently joined the working group.

I would also like to bring to your attention the upcoming 16th INTOSAI WGEA Assembly, which will be held 29 September - 3 October 2014 in the Philippines. The objectives of this meeting will be to report the progress of the INTOSAI WGEA projects to all members and provide a forum of knowledge and experience-sharing on current environmental auditing issues among the WGEA members. All SAIs are welcome to attend this event. For more information, please contact the INTOSAI WGEA secretariat.

The June 2014 edition of *Greenlines* includes a number of timely topics. The SAI of India provided a feature story about their experience conducting the first international training program on environment auditing in

2013. The News Briefs submitted by SAIs offer information and insights about the key environmental issues important to their countries. In the WGEA News, the Secretariat gives a short overview about the 13th Steering Committee meeting, the next Assembly meetings, and other secretariat activities.

I look forward to meeting all of you at the 16th INTOSAI WGEA Assembly in the Philippines.

Dr. Ali Masykur Musa
Audit Board of the Republic of Indonesia

Feature Story

India SAI Opens International Centre for Environmental Audit and Development

The increasing integration of environmental issues in planning and development in India has made it imperative that SAI India provides auditors with the skills necessary to audit environmental issues.



Accordingly, a new 16-acre training facility (pictured above) called the International Centre for Environment Audit and Sustainable Development (iCED) has opened in the picturesque city of Jaipur, about 250 kilometres from Delhi, the capital of India.
(*Read more on the following page...*)

WGEA News

- Highlights of the 13th INTOSAI WGEA Steering Committee Meeting, Lombok, Indonesia
- The Upcoming 16th INTOSAI WGEA Assembly Meeting
- The 8th Environmental Audit Survey
- Annual Environmental Audit Collection (2014)
- What's New on the Web

News Briefs from Around the SAI World



Botswana: SAI completes audit on the management of sand and gravel mining operations

Cyprus: Auditing beach management

Czech Republic: SAO continues work on energy savings project

Egypt: March 2014 meeting of the ARABOSAI Environmental Auditing team

Estonia: Audit of urban drinking water and waste water treatment systems

Finland: Increasing the transparency of climate related spending

Indonesia: SAI models social costs of water quality management programs

Iraq: Federal Board of Supreme Audit hosts the 7th ARABOSAI WGEA meeting

Kuwait: State Audit Bureau's role in Kuwait's environmental audits

Malaysia: Green technology financing provides an incentive for mitigating climate change

Norway: Auditor General of Norway has completed an investigation of the management of national parks

Russia: Accounts Chamber audits the waste management sector

Tanzania: Key resolutions during NAO's tenure as Chair of AFROSAI WGEA



India SAI Opens International Centre for Environmental Audit and Development

The increasing integration of environmental issues in planning and development in India has made it imperative that SAI India provides auditors with the skills necessary to audit environmental issues. Accordingly, a new 16-acre training facility called the International Centre for Environment Audit and Sustainable Development (iCED) has opened in the picturesque city of Jaipur, about 250 kilometres from Delhi, the capital of India.

About iCED

iCED seeks to harness India's expertise gained from conducting more than 100 environmental audits in the last 20 years to provide extensive training to auditors and government program managers and a forum for sharing their experiences in this field. It is also the Global Training Facility (GTF) for INTOSAI WGEA environmental auditors. iCED aims to be a global Centre of Excellence for improving accountability and governance in the area of environmental and sustainable development.



The new iCED facility in Jaipur

Design of the training programme

ITOSAI WGEA organised the training programme for the GTF course in partnership with SAI India. An INTOSAI sub-committee comprising SAIs from Brazil, Estonia, Finland, India, Norway, and the United States developed three modules: (1) introduction to environmental auditing, (2) auditing the environment and sustainable development, and (3) adapting the training to issues in the respective countries of auditors. The first module clarified concepts of environmental auditing and sustainable development, including special features of environmental audits. The second module developed participants' knowledge of selected basic processes and phenomena in the environment (e.g., water, waste, biodiversity, and climate change, and their vulnerabilities

to human intervention). The third module highlighted key points for auditing environmental risks with an emphasis on the selection of topics for environmental auditing. Participants were required to complete a pre-course template on environmental issues in their countries and, at the end of the course, submit a final paper on their audit of any environmental issue.

1st training programme of GTF

The first training programme was held from 25 November to 8 December, 2013, for 25 participants from 13 countries: Afghanistan, Bahamas, India, Indonesia, Kenya, Kuwait, Malaysia, Moldova, Nigeria, Rwanda, Saudi Arabia, South Africa and Turkey.



Participants in iCED's first GTF programme

Faculty included Ms. Tuuli Rasso, Head of International Relations at the National Audit Office of Estonia; Ms. Nameeta Prasad, iCED Director; Ms. Camilla C. Fredriksen, EUROSAI – WGEA Secretariat, Office of the Auditor General of Norway; and Ms. Paula Hebling Dutra and Ms. Elaine Ferreira Souza Dantas, Brazilian Court of Audit.

The training programme was designed not only to impart theoretical information about concepts but also to incorporate hands-on learning. Accordingly, presentations

GREENLINES

were supplemented by group activities like case studies, quizzes, site visits, and group presentations. Evening activities built on the day's learning through panel discussions on issues such as mining and good practices in waste management. Participants also visited an organic farm to study sustainable development and a national park to study initiatives to protect and conserve biodiversity. To lighten the atmosphere, participants also took a Heritage Walk in old Jaipur city that showcased local art and artifacts, attended a Light and Sound Show that described the history of Amber Fort and its rulers, were introduced to 100 years of Indian cinema through a Bollywood Appreciation Module, and visited a heritage village that showcased the cuisine of Rajasthan.



Visit to an organic farm

Feedback of the training programme

The training programme proved to be a great success as the course modules and faculty were highly appreciated by all the participants. Feedback for faculty ranged between 8.19 points and 9.29 points on a scale of 0 to 10. In the words of one participant from SAI, Kenya, "the overall module covered was well organised and clear, I think anyone that had no previous knowledge as well as those with experience could follow these lectures and understand them clearly." In addition, a participant from SAI, Kuwait expressed his appreciation for "the warm hospitality and conduct of this successful program, especially the faculty."

Participants also found panel discussions by practitioners in the field to be useful, as reflected in the remarks of one of the participants from SAI, Bahamas, "the [case study on solid waste management project at Unakoti District, Tripura] was very enlightening. The speaker was excellent. [I would be] grateful if his presentation is available to share with solid waste department in the Bahamas." It was especially heartening to know that the

participants felt that they would be able to use their new skills when they return home. This was the most important result of the training programme for the trainers as well as the participants.



A training session at the new iCED

The next programme of the GTF on Environment Audit will be held at iCED from 14 to 27 November, 2014. Invitation letters to all SAIs have been sent and will also be available on iCED's website <http://iced.cag.gov.in/> as well as on the website <http://environmental-auditing.org/>.

We hope to see you there.



Participants visit a national park in India

Highlights of the 13th INTOSAI WGEA Steering Committee Meeting, Lombok, Indonesia

The 13th INTOSAI WGEA Steering Committee meeting was held 2-5 April 2014 in Lombok, Indonesia. The meeting was attended by 38 delegates from 16 SAIs and by one SAI participating as an observer. The objectives of the meeting were to discuss and approve the project outlines of all the projects as well as the key milestones for the projects. In addition, the Steering Committee also discussed issues such as increasing cooperation between Regional WGEAs (RWGEAs) and WGEA and secretariat matters, such as progress made by the secretariat as well as some future plans.



The 13th Steering Committee meeting group photo in Senggigi, Lombok, Indonesia

The program began with an environmental excursion in Lombok. Delegates visited the Suranadi Forest, and each planted a tree in a deforested area. Afterwards, the delegates went forest trekking. Later in the afternoon, the delegates went to the beach near the Oberoi Resort to release baby turtles and plant corals. These activities signify the commitment of INTOSAI WGEA members to consistently safeguard the environment and leave a positive legacy for future generations. May our small step create a big difference for planet earth!



Delegates releasing baby turtles in Lombok



Delegates planting trees in Lombok

On the second day of the program, the Steering Committee meeting was held. A recap of the results follows:

- The Steering Committee approved the project plans of 7 research papers, 1 guidance update, and 4 ISSAIs reviews;
- The INTOSAI WGEA will continue to work closely with RWGEAs on the exchange of subject matter experts, translation of the WGEA output, and distribution of surveys, and audit collections;
- The 2nd International Training Program in the Global Training Facility in Jaipur, India, will be held from 14 - 27 November 2014;
- *Greenlines* will be published in June 2014;

- The dissemination of the training module on forestry auditing will be conducted by the SAI of Indonesia (BPK) in Indonesia; and
- The upcoming 16th INTOSAI WGEA Assembly meeting will be held from 29 September - 3 October 2014 in the Philippines.

The BPK salutes all the Steering Committee meeting participants for their efforts and hopes that the meeting generated productive, value-added ideas for all INTOSAI WGEA members in improving environmental quality worldwide.

The Upcoming 16th INTOSAI WGEA Assembly Meeting

The Upcoming 16th INTOSAI WGEA Assembly meeting will be held 29 September - 3 October 2014 in the Philippines. The objective of this meeting is to report the progress of WGEA projects to all members SAIs and provide a forum to share knowledge and experience on current environmental auditing issues among the WGEA members. It will be our pleasure to welcome all the members of INTOSAI WGEA to the Assembly Meeting in the Philippines.

The 8th Environmental Audit Survey

According to the 2014-2016 workplan, the Secretariat will conduct the 8th Survey of Environmental Audit in 2015. The survey will use the same general format as the 7th survey with proposed additional questions related to audits of disaster management and disaster-related aid as well as fraud and corruption in environmental management.

The Secretariat drafted the 8th survey from April through June 2014. The draft survey will be distributed to the Steering Committee for comment in July 2014. The deadline for comments will be 1 September 2014. After the draft survey is finalized and translated, the Secretariat will distribute the survey to all the INTOSAI members in February 2015. The deadline to respond to the survey will be 1 April 2015.

Annual Environmental Audit Collection (2014)

According to the 2014-2016 workplan, the Secretariat will conduct three annual audit collections during this work period. The Secretariat distributed the first of these environmental audit collections to all INTOSAI members in April 2014. The deadline for providing input is October 2014, and the Secretariat will upload the reports to the WGEA website by October 2014.

What's new on the Web

Website-related issues. The SAI of Norway requested that the WGEA website include a topic area for fraud and corruption issues in environmental auditing, and WGAADA requested that reports on audits of disaster-related aid also be kept on the WGEA website. The Secretariat responded by creating a new topic area on fraud and corruption with content to be provided by the SAI of Norway, and by placing audit reports on disaster-related aid in the "Environmental Audit Worldwide" section of the website.

Web-based Project Forum. To enhance communication between project leaders and subcommittee members and in response to a request from MBI Project Leader (SAI Estonia) on the need to share documents and online discussions, the Secretariat has developed a Web-based Project Forum powered by Microsoft Office365. A link will be provided on the main page of the WGEA website, and the Secretariat will provide this capacity for other projects if needed. Members will be able to share files, post articles, comment, and chat with other members of the project. Members can also edit documents online. Only members of the project will have full access to their project site; members from other projects will have read-only access. Each SAI can have one user, and a username will be sent directly to each project member.



The delegates discussed project outlines in the SC meeting



BOTSWANA: SAI completes audit on the management of sand and gravel mining operations

In April 2014, the Office of the Auditor General of Botswana completed an audit on the Department of Mine's (DOM) management of sand and gravel mining operations. The SAI conducted the audit to (1) determine the mechanisms employed by DOM to ensure that sand and gravel mining operations were appropriately managed for sustainable use of resources; (2) assess the effectiveness of mitigation measures in place to protect the environment from degradation; and (3) determine whether DOM had the capacity to manage sand and gravel mining operations. Key findings included the following:

- Existing mitigation measures to protect the environment from degradation were not effective. Specifically, legal frameworks are limited because they do not fully describe legal and illegal sand gravel mining operations. This has resulted in unsustainable harvesting and the use of detrimental methods to obtain these two resources. For example, methods used during river sand mining operations caused environmental damage to river banks. In addition, the SAI identified weaknesses in DOM's ability to take punitive measures against illegal sand and gravel operations. For example, the legal frameworks do not include provisions that allow DOM to impound trucks and machinery used to illegally extract sand and gravel. The SAI also found that some operations to extract resources did not comply with the Environmental Impact Assessment Act, thus damaging river bed embankments and water levels. In addition, the audit identified some cases of lax enforcement of the Act, which gave concessionaires the opportunity to illegally mine resources or further extend their plots. Moreover, some leased areas had not been rehabilitated following the cessation of mining operations as required by the Act. Indiscriminate legal and illegal operations at these sites led to deforestation and the loss of topsoil, which was stripped off for quality sand and gravel as opposed to being stockpiled for use in rehabilitating affected areas. These activities led to soil runoff and the loss of the ecological seed banks critical to the rehabilitation of these areas. In addition, abandoned pits have been used as waste dumping sites, such as for old tyres, and this has further polluted the environment and created additional hazards to the public.
- Environmental management education was limited among some communities and miners. In particular, some communities had little regard for monitoring the resources within their jurisdiction, while some miners used indiscriminate and detrimental sand harvesting methods that caused environmental degradation.

- The DOM had no capacity to mitigate and prevent damage to rivers, ecosystems, and the environment caused by indiscriminate practices.
- No scientific, quantitative assessments had been conducted to examine the magnitude of both river sand and gravel extractions and to provide insight into the effects of current sand and gravel mining practices throughout the country.

The report concluded that, to prevent illegal and indiscriminate sand and gravel mining operations, it is critical that the DOM and stakeholders identify the benefits gained by preventing such operations and develop all-encompassing, sound environmental strategies to enhance collective responsibilities.

The audit report will be available on the Botswana SAI website at <http://www.oag.org.bw>.



CYPRUS: Auditing beach management

The Audit Office of the Republic of Cyprus is conducting an audit on beach management. Because tourism is one of the most important sectors of the economy in Cyprus, its beaches are susceptible to excessive development. Therefore, proper and sustainable beach use is very important, for both environmental and financial reasons. The audit focuses on: (1) financial use of beach resources (e.g., beach facility rentals); (2) beach habitat preservation for key marine species (e.g., sea turtles and Mediterranean monk seals); (3) potential pollution from vessels; (4) interventions in beach protection zones; and (5) beach erosion. The Audit Office expects to complete its work by September 2014.

For further information please contact Mr. Akis Kikas, akikas@audit.gov.cy



CZECH REPUBLIC: SAO continues work on energy savings project

The Supreme Audit Office of the Czech Republic (SAO) was approved as leader of the energy savings project at the 15th meeting of the INTOSAI WGEA. Since that time, SAO representatives drafted a project plan and presented it to the 13th Steering Committee meeting held in Lombok, Indonesia, in April 2014. In response to comments received by members of the Steering Committee, the SAO made minor changes to the project plan. In addition, Egypt and Morocco joined the project team, bringing the total number of registered members of the team to 13.

SAO representatives are currently gathering survey data and have begun working on a draft report on the results of the project. A presentation of the initial results is scheduled for Autumn 2014. The main purpose of this project is to demonstrate the importance of energy savings as an audit topic and to further develop this topic by identifying key examples or case studies of best practices within the field of energy savings.

In addition, the SAO is conducting Audit No. 14/06, "Management of Funds Earmarked for the Support of Energy Production from Renewable Energy Sources." The final report of this audit will be published by the end of the year. The SAO also plans to conduct an audit in the field of energy savings in 2015. The results of these audits could be useful to the "Energy Savings" research project.

For further information, contact Eva Rekova at eva.rekova@nku.cz.



EGYPT: March 2014 meeting of the ARABOSAI environmental auditing team

The Accountability State Authority (ASA) of Egypt presided over the 7th meeting of the ARABOSAI Working Team for Environmental Auditing in Iraq in March 2014. During the meeting, working team members discussed the completion of elements of the team's 2013-2015 work plan, including

- research papers on environmental auditing in Arab countries on the topics of mining, energy, and dangerous medical wastes, and
- the status of Arab SAIs in implementing the International Standards of Supreme Auditing Institutions (ISSAI) into their own environmental auditing practices (specifically, ISSAI 5110, ISSAI 5120, ISSAI 5130, and ISSAI 5140).

Participants also reviewed the translation of seven guidelines issued by WGEA—a goal of the team's 2011-2013 work plan—and sent the translations to the WGEA Secretariat.

The meeting was a forum for ARABOSAI working team members to discuss their country's activities. Participants in the meeting listened to a summary of the workshop on *Cooperative Auditing* held by the World Bank and the ASA in December 2013 and discussed the results of a training program on *Economic Impacts Of Environmental Problems* held in May 2013 in Egypt. Team members also reported their work on the following research topics in the WGEA 2014-2016 work plan: Energy Savings (Egypt); Waste Management (Iraq and Palestine);

Environmental Evaluation (Tunisia); and the Marine Environment (Kuwait).

The ASA submitted the ARABOSAI Regional Progress Report to the 13th annual meeting of the INTOSAI WGEA Steering Committee in Lombok, Indonesia, in April 2014.



ESTONIA: Audit of urban drinking water and waste water treatment systems

The National Audit Office (NAO) of Estonia audited whether investments in waste water and drinking water treatment systems ensure that water quality requirements are met, are sustainable, and contribute to the ecological improvement of surface waters. The NAO found that, despite spending more than 1 billion euros since 2000, the Estonian government had not reconstructed all necessary waste water and drinking water treatment systems according to the schedule agreed upon with the European Commission. As a result, an investment of an additional 165 million euros is needed for the 2014-2020 European Union financing period for systems serving communities with a population over 2,000, while another 167 million euros must be invested into systems serving populations under 2,000. The NAO also concluded that the government has not paid enough attention to the long-term economic and financial sustainability of water service. The cost for water service will inevitably rise in the future because the price does not cover all costs (e.g., investment costs for basic assets). A sudden increase in water prices may create a situation where people are not able to pay for water service, which, in turn, could cause social and environmental problems.

On a more positive note, however, the NAO also found that investments in the waste water treatment systems have reduced the release of phosphorous and nitrogen compounds into the environment by approximately 34 percent in the last seven years.

The 2013 audit report is available in English online at: <http://www.riigikontroll.ee/tabid/206/Audit/2309/Area/15/language/en-US/Default.aspx>.

For further information, please contact Ms. Viire Viss at viire.viss@riigikontroll.ee

GREENLINES



FINLAND: Increasing the transparency of climate related spending

The National Audit Office of Finland (NAOF) conducted five audits of climate policy between 2009 through 2011. In 2010, NAOF found that a lack of coherence between land-use planning and transportation policies contributed to urban sprawl. This was exacerbated by fiscal policies, such as state subsidies, that favored the use of private cars. NAOF recommended that fiscal policies, such as tax deductions, should be regularly evaluated to determine whether their goals and methods are still valid.

In 2011, NAOF audited Finnish climate and energy policies. In particular, NAOF found that climate-related spending and other spending could unintentionally harm the climate. The Kyoto Protocol expects the Parties of the Protocol to phase out fiscal incentives that run counter to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change's objectives. Despite this expectation, NAOF found that the government had not comprehensively analyzed spending that could harm the climate and recommended that the government conduct such an analysis. According to the NAOF, such an analysis was necessary to improve the effectiveness and transparency of public spending. It would also allow decision-makers to better assess the effects of decisions in situations where policy goals conflict.

In a 2013 follow-up audit, NAOF found that the government had implemented its recommendation and identified environmentally harmful subsidies that totaled about four billion euros in 2011. For comparison, the climate-related spending over the same period was only 0.55 billion euros. More specifically, a government study found that the transportation sector received the largest share of the environmentally harmful subsidies (1.8 billion euros), followed by agriculture (1.1 billion euros), and the energy sector (700 million euros).

The summary of the audits related to Finnish climate policy can be found in: http://www.e-julkaisu.fi/vtv/finnish_climate_change_policies/

For more information, please contact Arto Seppovaara (arto.seppovaara@vtv.fi) or Vivi Niemenmaa (vivi.niemenmaa@eca.europa.eu), currently in the secondment at the ECA.



INDONESIA: SAI models social costs of water quality management programs

In January 2014, the Audit Board of The Republic of Indonesia (Badan Pemeriksa Keuangan, or BPK) completed a performance audit that assessed the effectiveness of the Water Resources Management agency's activities in the Brantas River watershed in East Java Province. One of the audit findings was that the Central Government's domestic sanitary waste pilot program was not effective because it did not encourage District Governments to prioritize the construction of sanitation facilities for domestic waste water. As a result, the quality of water from the Brantas River has deteriorated. That, in turn, has increased the cost of water use for business activities.

To calculate the effects of a decrease in water quality, BPK used a modeling approach to estimate economic and social costs of pollution. The BPK found that as more pollutants entered the river, the cost to treat the water increased. Water treatment companies are owned by local governments, and treatment operations are subsidized by water fees. The BPK found that increased treatment costs could require an increase in the fees, which will disproportionately affect the poor. The BPK modeled economic and social costs of water pollution and found that the social costs of the deteriorating Brantas river quality is projected at over 26 billion rupiah. The BPK concluded that decision makers could use this social cost in a cost benefit analysis of different economic growth policies. The BPK also concluded that the District Governments should be aware that the tax revenue from their rapid economic growth could be overshadowed by the increase in social costs caused by environmental degradation.

The BPK noted that the precision of its social cost models could be improved, but that they are a new way to efficiently deliver a message about the value of environmental degradation to stakeholders. In the future, BPK would like to broaden the use of this social cost approach in its environmental audits.



IRAQ: Federal Board of Supreme Audit hosts the 7th ARABOSAI WGEA meeting

The Federal Board of Supreme Audit in the Republic of Iraq (FBSA) hosted the ARABOSAI WGEA's 7th meeting in Baghdad from 16-20 March 2014. The following member states attended: Egypt (Team Leader), Iraq, Tunisia, Kuwait, Palestine, and the Republic of Yemen. At the meeting, member states discussed agenda items,

GREENLINES

contributions of the member states to the team work plan, topics, and programs.

The FBSA also participated in INTOSAI WGEA's XIII Steering Committee which was held in Lombok, Indonesia, on 2-5 April 2014. During the meeting, the steering committee announced the acceptance of Iraq's membership in the INTOSAI WGEA and participation in sub-committee projects from INTOSAI's 2014-2016 work plan. The project topics are renewable energy, led by Indonesia and Morocco, and an update of INTOSAI WGEA's 2004 guidance material titled "Towards Auditing Waste Management," led by Norway.

In addition, the FBSA attended the ASOSAI WGEA's Fifth Seminar and Fourth working meeting in Hanoi, Vietnam, on 15-17 April 2014. At the meeting, the FBSA presented its experiences with field auditing at solid waste landfill sites.



KUWAIT: State Audit Bureau's role in Kuwait's environmental audits

A team from the Kuwait's State Audit Bureau's (SAB) performance audit unit assessed the efficiency and effectiveness of the environmental activities of Kuwaiti government agencies. These assessments included:

An evaluation of preventive medicine systems applied in government laboratories. In 2011, SAB evaluated the preventive medicine systems used by government public health laboratories. SAB confirmed the importance of health laboratory management systems, ports and borders, health centers, and others complying with World Health Organization guidance and relevant agencies' instructions. For example, SAB found that liquid waste from laboratory testing was disposed of in sewage systems contrary to guidance from the Environment Public Authority—a practice that put health and safety at risk inside and outside of the labs.

An audit of Salmonella prevention in poultry. A performance audit assessed state agencies' ability to prevent *Salmonella* contamination in local poultry from 2007 to 2012. SAB confirmed the necessity of compliance with procedures and regulations adopted by the Health Ministry, the Public Authority of Agriculture Affairs and Fish Resources, the Environment Public Authority, and the Kuwait Municipality. The audit revealed a lack of coordination among those agencies that led to environmental problems and failed to provide adequate solutions. For example, the audit found that the improper disposal of slaughtered poultry remains led to an increase in pests that can spread disease.

Kuwait: The 6th Indo-Kuwait Joint Seminar on Environmental Auditing

As called for by a cooperative agreement signed by the SAIs of Kuwait and India, in April 2014 the two nations held their 6th joint seminar in Kuwait to discuss common environmental issues and compare auditing methodologies. The discussion included the legal framework for protecting the environment, audit planning, control procedures, audit reports, and case studies, as well as challenges and future aspirations. In addition, both SAIs presented information on recent audit experiences. The SAI of Kuwait presented a summary report on the discharge of liquid waste into the marine environment, and the SAI of India presented information on their overall experience in auditing water pollution prevention programs. The seminar concluded with recommendations that the two SAIs further cooperate in the future.



MALAYSIA: Green technology financing provides an incentive for mitigating climate change

Green technology is viewed as a sustainable method for coping with climate change. Green technology is defined as the development and application of products, equipment, and systems to conserve the environment and natural resources and minimize the negative effects of human activities. Green technology also provides an opportunity to increase Malaysia's capacity for innovation and enhance the country's competitiveness in the global arena.

The Green Technology Financing Scheme (GTFS) programme was established to provide assistance to the national manufacturing and service industries that produce green technology products and services for local and international markets. The programme also strives to provide green jobs. The GTFS strategy outlines the need for green technology development in four main sectors: energy, waste and wastewater management, building, and transportation. GTFS will fund projects that meet private financial institutions' requirements and also meet programme-specific green technology criteria. Eligible project applicants include users and producers. Users are applicants that use green products, equipment, or systems to conserve or protect the environment, while producers are those applicants that manufacture products that conserve or protect the environment. All applicants to the programme must undergo screening and certification by a respective authority prior to applying for financing from financial institutions.

In time, the national aspiration to grow more local green businesses and contribute to sustainable development will promote social and environmental benefits in Malaysia. The SAI of Malaysia looks to the GTFS

GREENLINES

programme to become an example of a best government practice that involves all stakeholders in decision-making and ensures the best value for the money. The SAI of Malaysia recommended that the various agencies responsible for implementing the GTFS programme conduct intensive monitoring to ensure its integrity and accountability.

For more information, please contact Fadzilah Bt. Hj. Mohammad at Fazee@audit.gov.my



NORWAY: Auditor General of Norway has completed an investigation of the management of national parks

In 2009, Norway's parliament, the Storting, adopted a new management model to give locally elected representatives greater control over the management of national parks. Under the new model, management of the parks is to be knowledge-based, locally rooted, and as uniform as possible. An inter-municipal national park board is to ensure that protected areas are comprehensively managed across administrative boundaries and within the framework of the Nature Diversity Act and conservation regulations. The investigation examined (1) whether the management model has worked as intended, and (2) whether the state has established an expedient system for providing guidance, documentation, and oversight. The investigation is part of an international cooperative audit on the management of national parks.

The first national park board was established in 2010. The establishment of a new local management model for national parks is in the final phase. The audit report stated that, while it is still too early to assess the extent to which the management model will achieve its objectives over time, there have been relatively few appeals from County Governors concerning the decisions of the national park boards, which may indicate that the management model has upheld the conservation objectives. It is clear from the audit that the new management model has largely been implemented as envisioned and that the model provides a basis for greater local participation and improved local coordination in national park management. The local management model has also allowed increased use of empirical local knowledge as a basis for management, including knowledge of local Sami traditions and interests in the national parks.

However, the report found the need for clarification on some key points. First, the statutes for the national park boards, as laid down by the Ministry of Climate and Environment, were not entirely consistent with the Storting's decision concerning who appoints the national

park boards. The Ministry stated that it will inform the Storting of this in an appropriate manner. Second, the audit showed that many actors and three levels of government—national park board, agency, and ministry—were involved in the management of the national parks, and that funding was divided. The consequence of this appears to be that the management of the national parks was not very efficient in terms of time and cost. Third, the audit also showed that the processing time was too lengthy for many of the appeals. Lastly, the audit showed there was a need for the Ministry to clarify the management role of the County Governor and the role of the expert advisory committees in management.

For further information, contact project leader Martin Finstad at martin.finstad@riksrevisjonen.no.



RUSSIA: Accounts Chamber audits the waste management sector

In 2013, the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation carried out an audit titled "An Analysis of Challenges and an Assessment of Waste Management Sector Conditions in the Russian Federation." The Chamber evaluated the level and quality of regulatory and legal support for the waste management sector. In addition, the Chamber evaluated the environmental conditions around the companies and military ranges that manage this waste. The Chamber recommended that the Government of the Russian Federation develop an effective system to manage waste, and the Government directed the Ministry of Natural Resources and Ecology of the Russian Federation to implement these recommendations.



TANZANIA: Key resolutions during NAO's tenure as Chair of AFROSAI WGEA

Over the past 8 years, the AFROSAI Working Group on Environmental Auditing (AFROSAI WGEA) has been instrumental in encouraging its member SAIs to conduct audits of environmental issues and programs and in helping them to build their capacity in this area. The practice of environmental auditing is now common in many African SAIs. SAI Tanzania assumed the role of chair of AFROSAI WGEA from 2007 to 2013 and set the groundwork for environmental auditing in the African Continent.

In its role as coordinator, SAI Tanzania spearheaded information exchange, capacity building, and the coordination of efforts such as cooperative audits at the regional level. SAI Tanzania served as a focal point for

GREENLINES

the exchange of information within INTOSAI WGEA. SAI Tanzania also organized meetings of regional members, in close cooperation with the SAI hosts, which resulted in the following key resolutions:

- To create awareness of environmental audit issues, SAIs need to conduct on-going workshops and training on environmental auditing for members of the Parliamentary Oversight Committee and Sectoral Committees, Permanent Secretaries, Ministers, and Chief Executive Officers.
- Environmental issues do not recognize political or geographical boundaries, therefore SAIs are encouraged to undertake joint or parallel environmental audits as part of their efforts to fight environmental problems facing the world. Joint or parallel audits will facilitate experience-sharing by learning and lead to capacity building, networking, and identification of best practices.
- With appropriate consideration of the need for independence, SAIs should establish working relationships with environmental regulatory institutions and other relevant bodies to enable them to share information to increase effectiveness in exercising their legal mandates.
- SAIs are encouraged to use external expertise in their environmental audits to enhance the quality of their work. However, SAIs must not surrender ownership and responsibility for their audits, in accordance with existing International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions.
- A joint or parallel environmental audit of Lake T Chad is urgently needed given the potential consequences to the African continent should the lake dry up. The findings should be addressed by individual governments surrounding the lake, and the Lake T Chad Basin Commission should make addressing the audit findings an African Union priority.
- SAIs should recommend that their governments put strategies in place to promote “green economy” projects. SAIs should audit such strategies to evaluate their effectiveness.

The SAI of Cameroon has since assumed the role of Chairman of AFROSAI WGEA and will serve until June 2016. The new Chair took over responsibilities for all important AFROSAI WGEA issues, including the development of the new AFROSAI WGEA work plan for 2014-2016.

For further information, contact Mr. Michael Malabeja at mmalabeja@nao.go.tz.